

Andrews University
Seventh-day Adventist theological seminary
Berrien Springs, Michigan

Sabbath in the Eastern Church

A historical study of Sabbath-keeping
among the Eastern Christians

Research paper in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the class of Sabbath/Sunday, CHIS 694

By:
Dojcin Zivadinovic

Instructor:
P. Gerard Damsteegt

December 2007

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction	2
I. Sabbathkeeping in the New Testament	5
Sabbath in NT	5
Sunday in NT	6
Jewish Sabbatons	7
Summary	8
II. Sabbath in Early Christianity	9
The Rise of Sunday Worship	9
Sabbathkeeping Resistance	12
Sunday edicts	15
Summary	16
III. Sabbath-keeping in early Eastern Christianity (400-700)	18
The time of Schisms	18
Churches of the East	21
Syria	22
Armenia	23
Egypt and Ethiopia.	24
Summary	25
IV. Sabbath in Medieval Orthodoxy	26
Greek and Balkan Orthodox Church	26
Bogomils	27
Sabbath and Great Schism	29
Russian Orthodox Church	32
Summary	36
V. Conclusions and Summary	39
Bibliography	43

INTRODUCTION

Through the centuries of Christianity, historical succession of political developments divided the Christian world, into two great halves, Eastern and Western Christianity. The root of this division was, roughly and broadly speaking, the division of the Roman Empire made first by Diocletian (284-305), and again by Theodosius I (395), then finally made permanent by the establishment of a rival empire in the West (Charlemagne, 800). The division of Eastern and Western Churches in its origin corresponds to that of the empires supporting the Church systems.

Statement of Problem

Most people in the West know very little about the doctrines of the Eastern Orthodox Church. This church is also sometimes known as the Greek Orthodox or simply the Orthodox Church and it has many semi-autonomous branches and affiliates, many of which are not Greek. There are probably two main reasons that Westerners know very little about the Orthodox Christianity. The first is that there are relatively few members of any Orthodox Church in the West (there are about 1 million in the USA) as Russia actually seems to have the most members. However, the Orthodox Church is quite large. News accounts have claimed that, in total, there are over 200 million Orthodox believers¹

¹ *Encyclopedia Britannica*, Online Edition, <<http://concise.britannica.com/ebc/article-9363331/Eastern-Orthodoxy>> 12/04/07

Another reason is that Orthodox Church doesn't produce much doctrinal literature (especially in English) as Protestants or Catholics. One Orthodox bishop seemed to confirm this as he wrote, "The Orthodox Church is not as much given to making formal dogmatic definitions as is the Roman Catholic Church".² On the other side, Eastern Orthodoxy possesses a large traditional and historical heritage, drawing its roots directly from the earliest Christianity in Palestine, Syria and Minor Asia.

While it is relatively known that by the 5th century, the Western Christianity turned to universal Sunday keeping, very few studies have examined in depth the development of Sunday/Sabbath issue among Christian Churches on East. Generally speaking, various authors agree that Eastern Christians were less prompt to change day of worship from Sabbath to Sunday but in what extent has the Sabbath-keeping been appreciated in Eastern Worship, remains an uninvestigated area.

Statement of Purpose

The main purpose of this study is to trace a New Testament continuance of Sabbath-keeping among Eastern Christians. This study examines not only mainstream Eastern Orthodoxy but explores the various smaller "Semi-Orthodox" groups and denominations which more or less enjoyed greater freedom than their Western counterparts.

² Timothy Ware, *The Orthodox Church*, London: Penguin Books, 1997, 204.

Methodology

This research intends to establish a historical overview of Sabbath-worshipping in Eastern Christianity. For this purpose we will study the history of Sabbathkeeping among eastern Christians from the early apostolic era until 21st century. The first chapter determines the place and theology of Sabbath in New Testament while the second chapter examines the Sabbathkeeping from 1st century until council of Ephesus in 431 when a series of schism was triggered that divided Eastern Christians into several denominations.

The third and fourth chapters of this study explore the Sabbatarianism during the long period of middle Ages and Reformation among both mainstream and non-mainstream Orthodox Churches. Finally the conclusion chapter resumes the present study and describes the position Sabbath and Sabbathkeepers hold presently in Eastern Christianity. Every chapter is expounded in chronological order, followed by a summary and personal comment. The author will give an effort to follow predominantly primary sources when ever they are available. Regarding the vocabulary, when the word “Sabbath” is used in this study it will refer exclusively to the English Saturday.

CHAPTER I:

The Sabbathkeeping in the New Testament

Since earliest times, Old Testament Sabbath was a holy day of the rest for the entire Jewish community prescribed through the 4th commandment and its mention is often in the early Christian literature. In the time of redaction of New Testament, Sabbath represented one of the main distinguishing signs between Jewish and surrounding Pagan cults and religions, generally observing Sunday or having no particular day of observance.

Sabbath in the New Testament

In the New Testament writings, the term Sabbath, seventh day, or Sabbaths is used a total of 63 times. Gospels mention number of instances of Jesus Sabbath-worships with fellow Jews (Mark 6:2; Luke 4:16, 31; 6: 6; 13: 10). Gospel writers mention Sabbath mainly in relationship with Jesus' disapproval of legalistic Sabbath-keeping performed by Jewish religious fundamentalists. He opposed Pharisaic regulations and the complicated set of laws related to Sabbath³, which according to Jesus was a "load too difficult to bear" (Matthew 23: 4, Luke 11: 46). Nevertheless, exclaiming the often-quoted phrase: "The Son of Man is the Lord even of Sabbath" (*Kurios tou Sabatou*) Jesus expressed both His

³ See Chris Rowland, "Sabbath observance in Judaism at the beginning of the Christian Era" in *From Sabbath to Lord's day* (ed. D. A. Carson), Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1982, 43-56.

Lordship and His support of the day of the rest set by God in creation of the earth (Gen 2:2, 3).

Although Jesus opposed Pharisaic Sabbath-traditions, there is no indication whatsoever that Jesus tried to replace Sabbath worship with any other day. In fact, couple days before His crucifixion, predicting the calamities and persecution of the future age, Jesus advised His disciples to pray that these great tribulations do not fall during the winter or on a *Sabbath day* (Matthew 24: 20), obviously showing that this day of rest will still be binding to future believers.

After Jesus' death, the Apostles are reported to continue the practice of Sabbath-keeping on the regular basis. The texts in Acts 13:14, 42-44, 16: 13, 17: 2, 18:4, reveal that even converted pagans worshipped on the Sabbath-day.

“...the Gentiles begged that these words might be preached to them the next Sabbath. Now when the congregation had broken up, many of the Jews and devout proselytes followed Paul and Barnabas, who, speaking to them, persuaded them to continue in the grace of God. On the next Sabbath almost the whole city came together to hear the word of God.”⁴

Sunday in New Testament

Sunday is mentioned eight times in the entire New Testament, six instances are referring to the time after Jesus was resurrected. And they are Matthew 28: 1, Mark 16: 2, 9; Luke 24: 1, John 20: 1, 19. None of them discuss any worship service; instead they refer to it as a day in which is permitted to work and balm Jesus dead body.

⁴ Acts 13:42-44 NKJV

The other two verses are found in Acts 20: 7 and 1 Corinthians 16: 2. The verse in 1 Corinthians 16, describes the first day of the week as a day of storing money for the future visit of the Apostle.

“...On the first day of the week let each one of you lay something aside, storing up as he may prosper, that there be no collections when I come...”⁵

This text shows that Sunday was seen by Paul as regular working day, in which financial operations could be performed. The verse in Acts 20: 7 describes one Christian meeting in which the worshippers prolonged their Sabbath service until midnight. Since in middle-Eastern setting, the day ends with the sunset, their meeting consequently entered into “the first day of the week”. However, this passage doesn’t contain any evidence that Sabbath sacredness was transferred to Sunday but rather shows that Sabbath celebration had tendency to be prolonged deep into the night. Therefore, this text is another proof of early apostolic Sabbathkeeping.

Abolition of Jewish *Sabbathons*

In spite of Paul’s teaching in regards to the abolition of Jewish ceremonial law, he never mentions obliteration of the fourth commandment concerning seventh-day Sabbath rest and worship. Paul disagrees with Christian obligation to observe Jewish ceremonial rituals, circumcision, food impurity, new moon festivals, and yearly holidays called *Sabbathons* (Gal 4, Colossian 2, Romans 14). These *Sabbathons* represent seven major Jewish ceremonial festivals (*Sabbath* means seven) but they also represent the years of jubilee, when every seventh year was a year of rest for the earth and year of deliberating

⁵ 1 Corinthians 16: 2 NIV

slaves.⁶ Paul doesn't address the issue of weekly Sabbath worship which is a part of Ten Commandments, or the “moral law” but the observance of “ceremonial law”, which symbolism, according to Paul, was accomplished in Jesus’ death and resurrection.

Summary

In Early Christianity, the first Christians were Jews, Jewish Proselytes and early Pagan converts, who on the weight of Biblical evidence such as Acts 13:14, 42-44, 16: 13, 17: 2, 18:4 are naturally assumed to have kept the Jewish customs, including the observation of the Sabbath from Friday sunset to Saturday sunset. We saw that the very founder of Christianity, Jesus Christ, has not made an attempt to abolish Sabbath but considered himself “The Lord of the Sabbath” and encouraged Sabbathkeeping in the future ages.

F. Nichol observes that since in apostolic times the seventh-day Sabbath was observed by all Christians, Jews and Gentile alike, any particular argument to prove the validity of the Sabbath in those early Christian times would have been pointless.⁷ The change from Sabbath to Sunday must therefore be a fruit of second century separation between Jews and Christians which we will study more thoroughly in the next chapter.

⁶ See Herold Weiss, *A Day of Gladness; The Sabbath among Jews and Christians in Antiquity*, Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 2003, 112-130.

⁷ See Francis D. Nichol, “Hebrews 4:9” in *The Seventh-day Adventist Bible Commentary*, Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1978.

CHAPTER II

Sabbath in Early Christianity

The rise of Sunday Worship

The first part of second century witnessed major separation between Jews and Christians. Before 100 A.D., the majority of Christians were of Jewish origins; they held worship services in synagogues, respected some Jewish alimentation ordinances as “kosher eating”⁸, kept major Jewish annual feasts⁹ and observed Jewish Ten Commandments, resting on Sabbath. In summary, Christians were generally seen as another Jewish sect.¹⁰ However around the end of first century the separation took place. Jewish rabbis were the ones to make the first step in creating a gap between Orthodox Jews and Jewish Christians by introducing a curse on the believers in Jesus (*Birkath-ha-Minin*), in the daily prayer and Sabbath worship.¹¹

By 130 A.D. in the time of Emperor Hadrian, the nature of Judeo-Christian relations got tense. Because of repeated Jewish revolts, climaxed by the famous revolt of

⁸ Not eating strangled animals and blood, Acts 15: 20

⁹ Herbert Thurston, “Calendar” in *Catholic Encyclopedia*, vol. 3, New York: The Encyclopedia Press, 1908, 158-166.

¹⁰ Samuel Bacchiocchi, “The Rise of Sunday Observance in Early Christianity” in *The Sabbath in Scripture and History*, (K. Strand, ed.), Washington: Review and Herald, 1982, 135.

¹¹ The twelfth benediction or *Birkath Haminin* was introduced around 80 A.D. see S. Bacchiocchi, *Anti-Judaism and the Origin of Sunday*, An excerpt of the Doctoral Dissertation, Rome: Pontifical Gregorian University Press, 1975, 34-37.

self-proclaimed Messiah Bar-Kohba, the Roman State became hostile to Judaism.¹² After Emperor Hadrian destroyed Jerusalem in AD 135, he took many Jews into exile, issuing an edict soon after, strictly prohibiting the observance of the Seventh-day Sabbath.¹³

In order to avoid persecutions, many Christians begun distinguishing themselves from Judaism, emphasizing the religious differences between Jews and Christians.¹⁴ The spirit of separation was particularly felt in Rome where the Jews were numerous and persecutions severer. Although still keeping the Sabbath, Christians publicly gathered in Sunday, when they would not provoke suspicions to be confused with Jews.

Bruce Metzger writes: “In the West, particularly after the Jewish rebellion under Hadrian, it became vitally important for those who were not Jews to avoid exposing themselves to suspicion; and the observance of Sabbath was one of the most noticeable indications of Judaism. In the East, however, less opposition was shown to Jewish institutions.”¹⁵

It would not be long before the rise of early Christian texts forged with the purpose to apologize the separation between Jews and Christians and offer theological justifications for the change in the day of worship.

¹² See Peter Tomson “The Wars against Rome; the Rise of Rabbinic Judaism and of Apostolic Gentile Christianity, and the Judeo-Christians” in *The Image of Judeo-Christians in Ancient Jewish and Christian Literature*, (P. Tomson and D. Lambers-Petry eds.), Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2003, 1-31.

¹³ Richard Krauss, “Hadrian” in *Jewish Encyclopedia*, 1907; also Solomon Grayzel, *The History of the Jews*, Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 1947, 184.

¹⁴ “The cruel and massive persecution of Christians that performed by fanatical Jewish zealots in Bar-Kohba revival, made the separation between Jews and Christians inevitable. The False Messiahship and the ruthless persecution added to Christian theological conviction, a racial resentment and an animosity toward the Jews.” (Bacchiocchi, *Idem*, 39)

¹⁵ Bruce M. Metzger, *Studies in Lectionary Text of the Greek New Testament*, vol. 2 Chicago: University Press, 1944, sec. 3: 12.

One of such writings¹⁶ was the epistle of pseudo-Barnabas, written around 130 A.D in Alexandria.¹⁷ The unknown author under the pseudonym of Barnabas (Paul's collaborator and missionary see Acts 13) developed a thesis that Seventh-day Sabbath is in fact a symbol of the final millennium or 1000 years of peace after 6000 years on this earth. He claims that he "keeps the eighth day", without mentioning whether he still refrains from work on Sabbath or not.¹⁸

Another writer who follows Barnabas in some aspects of his theology is Justin Martyr from Rome. He writes about the practice of Christians in Rome:

"...On the day of the Sun, all who live in cities or in the country gather together in one place, and the memoirs of the apostles or the writings of the prophets are read... Sunday is the day on which we all hold our common assembly, because it is the first day on which God, having wrought a change in the darkness and matter, made the world; and Jesus Christ our Savior on the same day rose from the dead."¹⁹

¹⁶ Several writings from the first part of second century have been estimated to mention Sabbath being superseded by the Lord's Day (Sunday). **1.** The letter of Pliny to Trajan describes that the Christians were meeting "on certain day before sunrise" (perhaps to avoid persecution and to enable work during daylight hours), but unfortunately Pliny does not tell us which day the Christians met on, or even whether it was weekly. (Pliny, *Letters*, 10: 96, (ed., tra. William Melmoth), New York: MacMillan, 1915, p. 403); **2.** Ignatius' *Letter to the Trallians*, verse 9 is a part from the 'longer version' of that letter, which scholars discount as not authentic – it was lengthened much later. The shorter version, whose authenticity is widely accepted, says nothing about "the Lord's Day". (*Letter to the Trallians*, verse 9, in *Ante-Nicene Fathers*, (American Edition reprint Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2001, vol. 1, pp. 95-105) **3.** In Ignatius' *Letter to the Magnesians*, like in the *Didache*, κυριακην would be better translated as "Lord's way" or combined with the Greek word that follows it, ζωντες, "Lord's way of life" or "Lord's living". (See *The Didache*, translated by Joseph B. Lightfoot in *Apostolic Fathers*, Lightfoot & Harmer, 1891, (2001 ed. Peter Kirby), pp. 121- 133; Ignatius, *Letter to the Magnesians*, verse 8. in *ANF*, 1: 154.) ; Since these texts are ambiguous on mentioning Sabbath or Sunday, we will omit them from our further discussion.

¹⁷ For the debate of dating Epistle of Barnabas see *ANF (Ante-Nicene Fathers)*, 1:181.

¹⁸ Epistle of Barnabas, 15 in *ANF* 1: 198.

¹⁹ Justin, *First Apology*, 67 in *ANF* 1: 257.

Although arguing that Sabbath is not a Christian holiday any more, Justin agrees to worship and associate with Sabbath-keepers “as long as they do not force other Christians to keep the Sabbath, or to observe any other ceremonies.”²⁰ The reports of Barnabas and Justin represent single testimonies of shift from Apostolic Sabbath-keeping in the first part of 2nd century.

It is important to notice that the Epistle of Barnabas, written in Alexandria and Justin’s letters from Rome both show characteristics of Gnosticism. Gnostic allegorical theology was particularly known to spiritualize the Decalogue (and by consequence the Sabbath) into a no-law and no-day theory.²¹ Gnosticism directly influenced many Church Fathers to explain the Sabbath as a symbol of the new era, which had been introduced by the advent of Christ, interpreting the Sabbath-rest in Hebrews 4:9 with future cessation from sin.²²

Sabbathkeeping Christians

In spite of Sunday emphasis made by Roman and Alexandrian dioceses there are many traces of continual Sabbathkeeping. Polycarp (AD 69 – 155), disciple of John the Apostle and bishop of Smyrna in the second century was esteemed to be Sabbathkeeper. In the letter *The Martyrdom of Polycarp* by the Smyrnaeans, his disciples wrote following: “on the day of the preparation, at the hour of dinner, there came out pursuers

²⁰ Justin, *Dialogue With Trypho*, 47 in ANF 1: 301, 302: “I hold that we ought to join ourselves to such [sabbatizers] and associate with them in all things as kinsmen and brethren.”

²¹ See August Neander, *General History of the Christian Religion and Church*, vol. II, , London: Henry G. Bohn, 1852, 194

²² Harline Craig., *Sunday: A History of the First Day from Babylonia to Super Bowl* Doubleday, NY, 2007, 5, 9-10.

and horsemen” later concluding that Polycarp was killed “on the day of the great Sabbath”.²³ The use of these two expressions (“day of the preparation” and “the day of the great Sabbath”) indicates that Christians in Smyrna were still keeping the Sabbath around 156 A.D. (the approximate date of Polycarp's martyrdom).²⁴

Another evidence from the mid second century of continuant Sabbath observance comes from the apocryphal work *Acts of John* where seventh-day Sabbath is mentioned as being a true “Lord’s day”.²⁵ In the late second century in Egypt, the unknown writer of apocryphal *Gospel of Thomas* (AD 180) wrote: “Except ye make the Sabbath a real Sabbath [*sabbatize the Sabbath*], ye shall not see the Father.” The Egyptian *Oxyrhynchus* Papyri, (200 A.D.) contain similar thoughts opposing a growing trend among Alexandrian Christians to neglect the Sabbath.²⁶

Theophilus of Antioch, (130- 185 AD) considered a Saint by both Catholic and Orthodox, was known to attack the use of icons, immortality of soul and quoted Sabbath as being the Seventh-day appointed by God in the fourth commandment.²⁷

²³ *The Martyrdom of Polycarp 8: 1* in ANF 1: 60, 61: Polycarp died a martyr when he was stabbed after an attempt to burn him at the stake failed. Polycarp was the disciple of John and is recognized as a saint in both the Roman Catholic and Eastern Orthodox churches.

²⁴ Polycarp is recorded to oppose roman bishop Artanas in his plans to elevate Sunday as a day on which the Resurrection Passover is to be celebrated.

²⁵ “And on the seventh-day, it being the Lord's day, he said to them: Now it is time for me also to partake of food.” ANF 8: 561.

²⁶ Stephen M. Patterson, “The Scholars Version translation of the Gospel of Thomas”, Verse 27 in *The Complete Gospels: Annotated Scholars Version*, Polebridge Press; 1994. *The Oxyrhynchus Papyri*, pt. L, p. 3, Logion 2, verses 4-11 (London: Offices of the Egypt Exploration Fund, 1898).

²⁷ “And on the sixth day God finished His works which He made, and rested on the seventh day from all His works. And God blessed the seventh day, and sanctified it... the seventh day, which all men acknowledge, the most know not that what among the Hebrews is called the

Tertullian of Carthage (220 AD), although personally preferring the Lord's Day, strongly opposed the Sabbath fast propagated by Roman Church, arguing that Jesus "maintained the honor of Sabbath".²⁸ His contemporary, Origen from Alexandria (200-250 A.D.), despite his theory of allegorical Sabbath-keeping, in admonished the believers to rest on literal Seventh-day Sabbath.²⁹

Although often cited in support of early Sunday observance, the long version of the letter of Ignatius to Magnesians, dating from the late third or early fourth century, actually contains one paragraph that supports observance of both Sabbath and Sunday:

"Let us therefore no longer keep the Sabbath after the Jewish manner... but let every one keep the Sabbath after a spiritual manner, rejoicing in meditation on the law, not in relaxation of the body, admiring the workmanship of God... and after the observance of the Sabbath, let every friend of Christ keep the Lord's Day as a festival"³⁰

Besides the reports of mainstream Christians keeping the Sabbath, we also have a lot of mention various non-conventional groups of Christians who had different conservative and Judaic leanings and worshipped Jesus Christ only on Sabbath, according to the fourth commandment. Iraeneus (190 A.D.), Eusebius (320 A.D.), Epiphanius (380 A.D.), and Jerome (400 A.D.), all report the existence of numerous Christian Sabbath

"Sabbath" is translated into Greek the "Seventh" (*ebdomas*), a name which is adopted by every nation, although they know not the reason of the appellation." (See Theophilus of Antioch, *To Autolycus*, Book 2, Chapter 12 in *ANF 2*: 154.

²⁸ Tertullian, in *ANF 3*: 44, 246, 362, 363; *ANF 7*:469;

²⁹ Origen, "Homily on Numbers" ch. 23 par. 4, in *Patrologia Graeca*, (J.-P. Migne ed.) vol. 12, Paris: Garnier Frères, 1956, 749, 750)

³⁰Ignatius, *Letter to Magnesians* 9 in *ANF*, 1: 91, 92.

keepers in Palestine, Syria and Minor Asia called *Nazarens*.³¹ According to these witnesses, Nazarens date from the time of Apostles and are known for observing strictly the Old Testament Jewish ceremonies and holidays including: Passover, Clean Meats, Circumcision, Sabbath, etc...³² Another Sabbath-keeping group mentioned are Ebionites who possessed similar practices as Nazarens but downplayed Jesus' divinity and worshipped on both Sabbath and Sunday.³³

Sunday edicts

In 321 A.D., Emperor Constantine issued a Sunday decree forbidding any work on the “Venerable day of the Sun” clearly showing his favoritism of Roman brand of Christianity.³⁴ Eusebius, bishop of Caesarea, and one of Constantine's most trusty

³¹ Irenaeus, *Against Heresies*, book 1, 26. 2 in *ANF*, 1: 503; Eusebius, *Church History and Life of Constantine*, book 3: 27, in *NPNF* (Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers, P. Schaff ed., reprint Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2001) vol. 1, pp. 227-230; Epiphanius, *Panarion*, 29: 8 in *The Panarion of Epiphanius of Salamis, Book I (Sects 1-46)*, Frank Williams, translator, Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1987, 119-152 ; Jerome, *to Augustine*, Letter 75, par. 13 in *NPNF* 1: 482.

³² Nazarenes continued to exist until about 400 A.D. They were sort of Unitarians, teaching that [Jesus/Yehoshua] was the Messiah, that he would soon return, that he was the Son of God but not divine himself, they kept many Jewish practices but rejected sacrifices and did not eat “unclean meat”. (Epiphanius, *Idem*, 18; 19: 5; 20: 3; 29: 1, 6) Eusebius trace their existence from the time of Paul and it is possible that it is against such that Paul wrote passages as Gal 4, Rom 14, Col 2.

³³ Gerhard Uhlhorn, “Ebionites”, in *A Religious Encyclopaedia of Biblical, Historical, Doctrinal, and Practical Theology*, vol. 2, (Philip Schaff ed.), 3rd ed. 1894, 684, 685.

³⁴ See *Codex Justinianus*, lib. 3, tit. 12, 3 in Philip Schaff, *History of the Christian Church*, vol. 3, New York: Scribner, 1902, p. 380; Constantine made another step to confirm Sunday by resolving the dispute on Passover/Easter dating during the Council of Nicea in 325. The council agreed and “Easter day was fixed on the Sunday immediately following the new moon which was nearest after the vernal equinox.” The practice of Polycarp and many Christians in Minor Asia was to celebrate Easter on the 14th day of Nisan. In urging the observance of this decree on the churches, Constantine assigned following reason for the decree: “Let us then have nothing in common with the most hostile rabble of the Jews.” (Eusebius, *Ecclesiastical History*, vol. 3, chapter 18 in *New Advent Catholic Encyclopedia*, Online edition, (K. Knight ed.), 2007, <<http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/25023.htm>>)

supporter reports: “All things whatsoever that it was duty to do on the Sabbath, these we have transferred to the Lord's Day [Sunday].”³⁵ Nevertheless, Constantine’s decrees did not prohibited rest on Sabbath, and Sunday laws were limited mainly to the urban areas. Sabbath keeping in Asia Minor was publicly still going on to at least 364 A.D. until the Eastern Church convened a Council in Laodicea to excommunicate any who rested on the seventh day. The Canon 29 of the Synod decision states:

“Christians must not judaize by resting on the Sabbath, but must work on that day, rather honoring the Lord's Day; and, if they can, resting then as Christians. if any shall be found to be judaizers, let them be anathema from Christ”³⁶

This decision of synod encountered reactions from many bishops in Asia Minor and Syria. Gregory of Nyssa (330-395) attacked exaltation of Sunday on the expense of Sabbath saying: “...With what eyes can you behold Sunday, if you desecrate the Sabbath? Don’t you know that these days are brethren? He, who elevates one, disregards the other...”³⁷ Athanasius (A.D. 297-373), Bishop of Alexandria likewise tells us that even after the council at Laodicea many Christians held religious assemblies on the Sabbath, not because they were infected with Judaism, “but to worship Jesus, the Lord of the Sabbath.”³⁸

³⁵ Eusebius, *Commentary on the Psalms* (Psalm 92) in *Patrologia Graeca* (J-P Migne, ed. Reprint Paris: Garnier Frères, 1952), vol. 23, pp. 1171, 1172.

³⁶ *The Complete Canons of the Synod of Laodicea*, Canon 29 in *New Advent Catholic Encyclopedia*, Online edition (ed. Kevin Knight), 2007, <www.newadvent.org/fathers/3806.htm>

³⁷ Gregory of Nyssa, *De Castigotione* (On Reproof) in *Patrologia Graeca*, vol. 46, pp. 309, 310.

³⁸ Athanasius, *Homilia de Semente*, section 1 in *Patrologia Graeca*, vol. 28, p. 144.

In response to the Sabbath neglect, but mainly out of concern for the preservation of Apostolic practices in Eastern Christianity, the bishops in Minor Asia often referred to an important early document called *The Apostolic Constitution* which eventually became basis of Eastern Orthodox practices. This document, which first known edition was written around 375 AD, admonishes special observance of Sabbath as well as and Sunday:

“...Assemble yourselves together every day, morning and evening... but principally on the Sabbath-day and on the day of our Lord's resurrection, which is the Lord's day... keep the Sabbath, and the Lord's day festival; because the former is the memorial of the creation, and the latter of the resurrection.”³⁹

Summary

The controversy between Sabbath and Sunday was an ongoing issue in early Christianity. These two weekly festivals seemed to co-exist in Eastern Churches, both representing days of worship. The rise of Sunday observant Christians in 2nd and 3rd century soon influenced other Eastern Churches to place a special emphasis on Sunday. In the fourth century, Sunday observers in Rome made the strongest appeals for the complete abolition of Sabbath as a day of rest and worship, instigating the Sabbath fast and annulling the partaking of Lord's Supper in that day.⁴⁰

Many eastern Christians, however, resisted the abolition of Sabbath. Despite the efforts made in this direction by Emperor Constantine and edict of Laodicea, Sabbath was

³⁹ *Constitutions of the Holy Apostles*, Book 7, Section 2; Book 8, Section 4 and 23 in ANF 7: 712.

⁴⁰ The bishop Sylvester I from Rome was the first one to decree that the rest of the Sabbath should be transferred rather to the Lord's Day [Sunday]. (Sylvester I, *Concerning the Instruction of the Clergymen*, Book II, Chap. 46, in Mignes's *Patrologia Latina*, Vol. 107, p. 361)

preserved among many Churches of the East. Several bishops stood in the defense of old apostolic practices forging the Constitution which allowed worship on both Sabbath and Sunday. Thanks to these efforts, Sunday, never took the significance of Sabbath among Eastern Churches and Sabbath continued to be respected as the fourth commandment and day of rest.

The late fourth and early fifth century saw the continued emphasis on Sabbathkeeping on East creating new controversies between Eastern and Western Christians. These matters will be examined in the next chapter.

CHAPTER III

Sabbath-keeping in early Eastern Christianity (400-700)

The fifth century was the peak of the “era of councils” when numerous synods and councils were called to deal with schisms which attacked the Church. From the West the Church was striving against Latin Catholicism while on the East the Nestorian schism was threatening. These pressures were conjugated with the ever-present menace of Arianism from the inside of the Church.

Different treatment of Sabbath on East and West

One of the polarizing factors between Constantinople and Rome was the issue of Sabbath observance. Fifth century Greek historian, Socrates Scolasticus (b. 380), observes this rising antagonism:

“...For although almost all churches throughout the world celebrate the sacred mysteries [Lord’s Supper] on the Sabbath of every week, yet the Christians of Alexandria and at Rome, on account of some ancient tradition, have ceased to do this. The Egyptians in the neighborhood of Alexandria, and the inhabitants of Thebes, do hold their religious assemblies on the Sabbath, but do not participate of the mysteries in the manner usual among Christians in general...”⁴¹

⁴¹ Socrates, *Ecclesiastical History*, book 5, chapter 22 in Phillip Schaff and Henry Wace (eds.), *NPNF*, 2: 132.

The division in practices between East and West is also reported by another fifth century Greek historian Sozomen (b. 400): "...The people of Constantinople, and almost everywhere, assemble together on the Sabbath, as well as on the first day of the week, which custom is never observed at Rome or at Alexandria."⁴²

At that time, both Trinitarian and Arian bishops and emperors inside of Eastern Church also traditionally observed the Sabbath-keeping. Describing different Arian beliefs and practices, Socrates Scholasticus wrote: "The Arians, as we have said, held their meetings outside the city. As often therefore as the festival days occurred, Saturday (Sabbath) and Lord's day, in each week, on which assemblies are usually held in the churches, they congregated within the city gates about the public squares, and say responsive verses adapted to the main heresy."⁴³

Asterius, bishop of Amasa in Pontus also an Anti-Trinitarian, describes the attitude of many Christian in Minor Asia regarding Sabbath. He writes:

"It is beautiful to Christians and the industrious that the team of these two days comes together. I speak of the Sabbath and the Lord's Day, which time in its course brings around weekly. For as mothers and nurses of the church they gather the people, set over them priests as instructors, and lead both disciples and teachers to have a care for souls."⁴⁴

Even though the Christians in Alexandria rejected Sabbath observance, many Christians in other cities and villages in Egypt still continued the practice of Sabbath-

⁴² Sozomen, *Memoirs*, book 2, chapter 19, in *NPNF*, 2: 391.

⁴³ Socrates, *Ecclesiastical History*, book 6, chapter 8, in *NPNF*, 2: 144.

⁴⁴ Asterius of Amasea, "sermon 5: On Divorce" in *Sermons*, transcribed by Roger Pearse, Ipswich, 2003, <http://www.earlychristianwritings.com/fathers/asterius_05_sermon5.htm>

keeping. Latin Historian Cassian (d. 435) reports that the Egyptian monks continue to celebrate both Sabbath and Sunday, according to the custom of the Greek Churches.

“...These offices which we are taught to render to the Lord at separate hours and at intervals of time, with a reminder from the convener, are celebrated continuously throughout the whole day...incessantly practiced by them in their cells...Wherefore, except Vespers and Nocturns, there are no public services among them in the day except on Saturday and Sunday, when they meet together at the third hour [nine o’clock in the morning] for the purpose of Holy Communion.”⁴⁵

That there were weekly religious services among the monks of Egypt on the Sabbath, Cassian thus affirms: “But on the day of the Sabbath and on the Lord’s Day they read both lessons from the New Testament.”⁴⁶

This practice of Sabbath-observance, so clearly characteristic for Greek Christians was brought from the East to the West by the Greek missionaries. In the fourth century, the early Greek missionary Ulfilas (ca. 310-383) from Asia Minor introduced Christianity among Goths. It is believed that Ulfilas, as all Greek Christians of that time, was a Sabbath-keeper, teaching the Goths to observe the Seventh-day Sabbath. Latin Historian Sidonius Appollinarus reports following about the Ostrogoths:

It is a fact that formerly those who dwelt in the east were accustomed as a church to sanctify the Sabbath in the same manner as the Lord’s day, and to hold sacred assemblies; wherefore Asterius, bishop of Amasia in Pontus, in a homily on incompatibility called Sabbath and Sunday a beautiful span, and Gregory of Nyssa in a certain sermon calls these days brethren and therefore censures the luxury and the Sabbatarian pleasures; while on the other hand, the people of the west, contending for the Lord’s day, have neglected the celebration of the Sabbath, as being peculiar to the Jews... It is, therefore, possible for the Goths to have thought, as pupils of the discipline

⁴⁵ Cassian, *Institutes*, 3: 2 in *New Advent Catholic Encyclopedia*, Available Online: <<http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/3507.htm>> 12/31/07

⁴⁶ Cassian, *Institutes*, 2: 6 in *Idem*.

of the Greeks, that they should sanctify the Sabbath after the manner of the Greeks.⁴⁷

Visigoths and Ostrogoths which invaded Italy and Spain were traditionally known for holding Anti-Trinitarian view of Godhead and for keeping Saturday as the day of worship.⁴⁸ The great Ostrogoth leader, Theodoric (AD 454-526) was also believed to observe the 7th Day Sabbath. The presence of the Sabbath-keeping Christians in Italy at that time is also reported by Roman pontiff Gregory I (540-604). Gregory opposed the Sabbath-keepers, calling them ‘pre-cursors of Antichrist’

“...It has come to my ears that certain men of perverse spirit have sown among you some things that are wrong and opposed to the holy faith, so as to forbid any work being done on the Sabbath day. What else can I call these but preachers of Antichrist.”⁴⁹

These reports represent strong evidence that many Eastern Christians, of Constantinople, Minor Asia, Syria and even in Egypt have not replaced Sabbath with Sunday but kept both days in admiration. This practice of the Greek churches was so pervasive that was even passed onto Gothic tribes who settled in the West.⁵⁰ Thus both in East and West, Greek Christians, have observed the Seventh-day Sabbath as a day of worship and abstinence of secular activities while Sunday was seen as a day of celebration.

⁴⁷ Sidonius Apollinaris, *Epistolae*, book 1, letter 2, in *Patrologia Latina*, 58: 448 translated in Benjamin G. Wilkinson, *Truth Triumphant: The Church in the Wilderness*, Rapidan (VI): Hartland Publications, 1995, pp. 136, 137.

⁴⁸ Wilkinson, 136-139.

⁴⁹ Gregory I, *Registrum Epistolarum*, Book 13, Letter 1 in *New Advent Catholic Encyclopedia*, Available Online: <<http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/3602.htm>> 12/31/07

⁵⁰ In the west, the Sabbath was also observed by Celtic Christians who first accepted the gospel from the Greek missionaries. James C. Moffatt, D. D., *The Church in Scotland* (Philadelphia: 1882), 140. Wilkinson, 120-134.

Churches of the East

In the fifth century, the Arian controversy was joined by Nestorian schism which changed the face of Eastern Christian World creating a gap between Greek-Orthodox Christians and the Churches of the East. In the year 431, the council of Ephesus deposed Nestorius, bishop of Constantinople who opposed the Church teaching on one nature in Christ claiming that Jesus had dual nature.⁵¹

The Churches that sided with Nestor in this controversy were Eastern Churches, who disagreed with many other issues with main Church, such as reformulations on the nature of Godhead, elevation of Mary and saints and occasional downplay of Sabbath. The Churches of Syria, Mesopotamia, Persia, Armenia, Ethiopia and Coptic Egypt all sided with Nestor and were since then considered as heterodox. These Churches became historically known under the name the “Churches of the East.”⁵²

Syrian Christians

Nestorius, who eventually found himself deposed and exiled after the council of Ephesus found many followers in Syria. The Syrian Nestorians still exist today. *New Schaff Herzog Encyclopedia* observes: “Nestorians eat no pork and keep the Sabbath as a

⁵¹ Alexander Schmemmann, *The Historical Road of Eastern Orthodoxy*, New York: Holt, Rienhart and Winston, 1963, p. 120-142.

⁵² For a good geographical survey on Eastern Churches see Ronald Roberson, *The Eastern Christian Churches*, Roma: Edizione Orientalia Christiana, Istituto Pontificio Orientale, sixth edition, 1996 (1st ed. 1986); For theological commentary on Eastern Churches see Aziz S. Atiya, *A History of Eastern Christianity*, London: Methuen and Co., 1968.

weekly festival as well as Sunday. They have no auricular confession; they know nothing of purgatory. Their priests are allowed to marry.”⁵³

In 553 Jacob Baradaeus, a follower of Eutachus, rejected the council of Chalcedon and founded the Jacobites in Syria. The Jacobites were also Sabbathkeepers but they differed from Nestorians in that they believed Christ had only human nature and used unleavened bread in the Eucharist and not leavened as Nestorians.⁵⁴

The Syrian Sabbathkeeping Christians cherished extremely missionary spirit. They spread towards Persia and China where they existed for over 1000 years. Syrian Sabbathkeeping Christianity flourished under the Mongols and was even accepted among many high-rank Mongol officials during Mongolian rule.⁵⁵

In 1625 Jesuit missionaries in China discovered an ancient Chinese monument that reported existence vast extent of the seventh-day Sabbath-keeping Christian Church of the East of millennia before! The monument, dating from 781 and written in Syriac and Chinese included these words: “at the command of Emperor Tae-Tsung, to honor the arrival of a Syrian missionary and his companions to the capitol in the year AD 635 from Ta Tsin (Judea)”. One of the passages reads: “On the Seventh-day we offer sacrifices after having purified our hearts, and received absolution from our sins. This religion, so

⁵³ Johannes Kunze, “Nestorians” in *New Schaff Herzog Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Baker House (reprint), 1953, pp. 120-123; “There existed large Sabbath-keeping bishoprics or conferences of the [Nestorian] Church of the East stretching from Palestine to India.” Alphonse Mingana, *Early Spread of Christianity in central Asia and Far East*, vol. 10, Oxford: University Press, 1925, p. 460.

⁵⁴ Kunze, “Nestorians”, p. 122;

⁵⁵ In the 13th century Marco Polo and other travelers to china and Mongolia came across numerous Sabbathkeeping Syrian Christians, which included Nestorians and Jacobites. Sabbathkeeping subsisted in China and Mongolia until the end of the 14th century when Tamerlane the Turk conqueror made sure that all Christianity disappears in his kingdom. See Wilkinson, *Truth Triumphant*, pp. 337-339.

perfect and so excellent, is difficult to name, but it enlightens darkness by its brilliant precepts.”⁵⁶

Armenians

Although not adopting Nestorianism, Armenian Church had loosely detached itself from Byzantium Orthodoxy mainly on the issue of veneration of icons and elevation of Mary. Despite Persian and Roman influence, Armenian Christians maintained a strong belief in Sabbath as a day of rest and worship.⁵⁷

Already in the late fourth century, there is report of Semi-Arians in Armenia who kept the seventh-day Sabbath. Tamar writes: “...Eustathius was succeeded by Erius, a semi-Arian... he urged a purer morality and a stricter observance of the Sabbath.”⁵⁸ Alexander Ross, the traveler in east in the seventeenth century wrote that until his day most of the Armenians believed that Christ rose from the dead on Sabbath.⁵⁹ By 728 AD, at the Council of Manazkert, Armenians consented with Eastern Orthodox Church that “Saturday as well as Sunday, is made a day of feasting and synaxis.”⁶⁰ The Armenians of

⁵⁶ Paul Wong, “The History of the Sabbath and Sunday” in *The Sabbath Sentinel*, Gillette: Bible Sabbath Association, vol. 52, no. 5, p. 7.

⁵⁷ Tamar Davis, *A General History of the Sabbatarian Churches*, Philadelphia: Lindsay and Blakiston, 1851, p. 18-24.

⁵⁸ Idem, p. 20.

⁵⁹ Due to Hebrew version of the Gospel of Matthew who mentions Jesus’s resurrection happening late in Sabbath evening. See Blaine Neumann, *A History of the Seventh day Sabbath among Christians in Asia, Africa, Europe and North America*, Gillette: Bible Sabbath Association, 2004, p. 6, 7, 11; See also Alexander Ross, *Panseebia: A view of all Religions of the World*, London: John Saywell & Co, 1655., p. 219.

⁶⁰ Kenneth Strand, *Sabbath and Sunday in Scripture and History*, Washington: Review and Herald, 1982, p. 162.

today still celebrate Eucharist on Sabbath as well as Sunday according to the *Apostolic Constitution*.⁶¹

Ethiopian and Coptic Christians

Sabbath observance was introduced at the earliest stage of Christianity in Egypt and Ethiopia. In the fourth century, Ethiopian bishop Frumentius reported: “And we assemble on Saturday... not that we are infected with Judaism, but to worship Jesus, the Lord of the Sabbath”⁶²

Towards the end of the 5th century, nine Monophysite priests from Syria introduced monasticism into Egypt and Ethiopia. Whether or not due to these nine monks, the Ethiopian Orthodox Church, along with the Coptic Church of Egypt, and smaller churches in Syria, Turkey and Armenia, have remained non-Chalcedonian.

As late as 16th century, Ethiopian Christians worshipped almost exclusively on Sabbath. Some of the statements by Ethiopian Emperor Galawdewos (A.D. 1540-1559) represent the evidence of perpetual Sabbath keeping: “We do celebrate the Sabbath, because God, after He had finished the Creation of the World, rested thereon... and that especially, since Christ came not to dissolve the law but to fulfill it. It is therefore not in the imitation of the Jews, but in obedience to Christ, and His holy apostles, that we observe that day.”⁶³

Summary

⁶¹ Malachia Ormanian, *The Church of Armenia*, New York: St. Vartan Press, 1988, p. 166.

⁶² Davis, pp. 41, 42.

⁶³ Charles E. Bradford, *Sabbath Roots, The African Connection*, L. Brown and Sons, Barre (VT), 1999, p. 26.

The early Byzantine period was the epoch of turbulent changes in Eastern Christianity; the religious-political tensions between various Christian groups growing bigger by the decades. The long-existing issue between East and West was joined by Arian and Nestorian schisms. It seemed that Eastern Orthodoxy was going to break in pieces under numerous conflicts that weighed down on the Church.

While these political and theological divisions started creating a gap between East and West, and between Greeks and Syrian Churches of the East, the Sabbath observance remained very strong among all of Churches of the East and in slightly weaker forms in Greek Orthodoxy. Regarding the Sabbath issue we can say that Christianity started to separate in three worlds: West, Orthodox and Eastern Christianity with each having a particular treatment of the Sabbath commandment.

CHAPTER IV

Middle Age Orthodoxy

The political struggles in the sixth century, such as invasion of Muslims from one side and Slavic tribes and Mongols from the other, made Byzantine Empire lose most of its size, leaving behind many Churches in Syria, Palestine, Assyria and Persia. Especially painful was the loss of Northern African Christian stronghold, Alexandria in Egypt.

After the Muslim invasion, Byzantine Empire experienced the influx of Eastern Christians who were main instigators of Church reforms such as iconoclasm and restoration of Sabbath. In 730 A.D, the reform made at the Council of Hieria, decided to restore 2nd and 4th commandment of Decalogue, issuing a decree of forbidding icons in Church worship and reviving stricter Sabbath and Sunday observance.⁶⁴

Sabbathkeeping in Balkans

One of the issues of the Byzantine Christianity was also growing rivalry between Roman bishop and the patriarch in Constantinople. The disagreements between two ecclesiastical authorities were also including practice of Sabbath observance. In the early 800s the Sabbath issue arose in Balkans, territory claimed by both patriarch from Constantinople and Roman Bishop. In the early seasons of evangelization, Bulgarians

⁶⁴ Sometime between 726-730, the Byzantine Emperor Leo III the Isaurian ordered the removal of an image of Jesus prominently placed over the Chalke gate, the ceremonial entrance to the Great Palace of Constantinople, and its replacement with a cross. (see Theophanes, *Chronographia* quoted in Gustave E. von Grunebaum, "Byzantine Iconoclasm and the Influence of the Islamic Environment" in *History of Religions*, vol. 2, no. 1 (Summer, 1962), pp. 1-10)

had been taught that no work should be performed on the Sabbath. The Bulgarians had been accustomed to rest on the Sabbath.

In the ninth century, bishop of Rome, Nicholas I, sent the ruling prince of Bulgaria a long document saying that one is to cease from work on Sunday, but not on the Sabbath. Pope Nicholas I also gave series of precepts and rules concerning the Sabbath, as for example: “Bathing is allowed on Sunday... One is to cease from work on Sunday, but not also on the Sabbath.”⁶⁵ Pope continues, “Because you observe the Sabbath with the Jews and the Lord's Day with us, you seem to imitate with such observance the sect of Nazarenes.”⁶⁶

In Constantinople, Photus, Patriarch of Constantinople and the head of the Greek Church, offended at the interference of the Pope, deposed Nicolas in counter-synod and declared the Pope excommunicated. The main charge against Romans was: “Against the canons, they induce the Bulgarians to fast on the Sabbath.”⁶⁷

Bogomils

Sabbath was not only observed and defended by official Patriarchal Church but also by various small heterodox groups inside of Balkan Peninsula. In the eighth and ninth centuries, many Armenian Sabbathkeepers called Paulicians were forcibly resettled in the Balkans by Byzantine emperors. They were placed there as a bulwark against the

⁶⁵ Nicolai Papa I, “Consulta Bulgarorum”, Responsum 10, found in Giovanni D. Mansi, *Sacrorum Conciliorum Nova et Amplissima Colectio*, Vol.15 Paris: H. Welter, 1920; p. 406;

⁶⁶ *Patrologia Latina*, Vol. 145, p. 506; see also Joseph Hergenroether, *Photius*, Vol. 1, Regensburg: G. J. Manz, 1869, p. 746.

⁶⁷ Hergenrother, 643, see also Karl Joseph Von Hefele, *Conciliengeschichte*, vol. 4, Freiburg im Breisgau: Herder, 1877, pp. 346-352, sec. 478.

invading Bulgar tribes. Relocated to the Balkans, these Paulicians came to be called Bogomils.⁶⁸

The probable origin of the name has been usually found in the two Slavic words *Bogu mili*, “Beloved of God”. However, two early Bulgarian manuscripts have been discovered which are confirmatory of each other in the common point that a “pope” [leader] Bogomile was the first to promulgate their teaching in the common tongue under Bulgarian Tsar Peter, who ruled from 927 to 968 (A.D.)⁶⁹

Bogomils taught that Baptism was only to be practiced on grown men and women and that the images and crosses were idols.⁷⁰ They taught that the congregation consisted of the “elect” and that each individual should seek to attain the perfection of Christ. They also stressed on the Law of Moses with the exception of sacrifices and accordingly they practiced circumcision, abstained from the unclean meats and observed the Sabbath as a day of rest. They disbelieved in Trinity but accepted Christ as divine. They were reported to heal the sick and cast out demons.⁷¹

Radical opposition to the renewal of icon-worship among Greeks in the ninth century and claims that all the governments of the World are possessed with Satan helped to condemn Bogomils as heretics by the official Church.⁷² In the tenth and eleventh

⁶⁸ Benjamin J. Kidd, *The Churches of Eastern Christendom*, London: Faith Press, 1927, pp. 156, 157, 185.

⁶⁹ Moses Gaster, “Bogomils” in *Encyclopedia Britannica*, 11th ed., vol. 5, Cambridge: 1910, pp. 119, 120.

⁷⁰ Dimitri Obolensky, *The Bogomils*, Cambridge: University Press, 1948, p. 103.

⁷¹ *Idem*, p. 49.

⁷² David Chidester, *Christianity: A Global History*, San Francisco: HarperCollins, 2000, p. 265.

centuries many Bogomils spread westward from Bulgaria and settled in Serbia. By the end of the twelfth century, large numbers took refuge in Bosnia.

The Bogomil position in Bosnia was tenuous due to their challenges to the authority of the established church. Encyclopedia Britannica writes: “Both Roman Catholic and Orthodox powers had conducted sustained campaigns of persecution against the Bogomils, and Ottoman Turkish promises of freedom found a responsive hearing among them...”⁷³ Bogomils eventually spread through the southern Europe and settled in Northern Italy and Southern France preaching and forming communities that will later be organized and called Albigenses.⁷⁴

Sabbath and Great Schism

The Sabbathkeeping among Eastern Christians was creating a breach which widened with the passing of the centuries until the last tie that bound them together with Western fellowship snapped in the summer of A.D. 1054. One of the main issues involved in that controversy was the matter of fasting on the Sabbath. In 1053, the disagreement on this topic became verbally violent. In that year the Metropolitan Archbishop Leo of Okhrida and Patriarch Michael Cerularius of Constantinople wrote an open letter to Bishop John of Trani in Ampulia (southern Italy). Bishop John was on the

⁷³ Moses Gaster, “Bogomils” in *Encyclopedia Britannica*, 11th ed. (1910), vol. 5, p. 120; Large numbers of Bogomils accepted Islam, being followed by a significant proportion of the Bosnian aristocracy, who saw in conversion the opportunity to retain their lands and titles. Bogomils non-icons preaching and abstention from unclean meats found warm response among Turks. Bogomils were permitted to have their worship as long as they accept Allah as supreme God. In 1463 Mehmed II, the Ottoman sultan conquered Bosnia with the help of Bogomils. One of the surprising facts of history is that some of the Bosnians in ex-Yugoslavia are the descendants of Bogomils.

⁷⁴ Gaster, p. 119.

side of the Greeks in this controversy. The latter contained a vigorous protest against the Roman practice of making the Sabbath a fast day.⁷⁵

In the same time Nicetas Stethatos a learned monk and presbyter of the monastery of Studion in Constantinople, wrote his *Booklet Against the Latins* in which he attacked various unscriptural practices of the Roman Church, especially the violation of *Apostolic Constitutions* and Sabbath desecration.⁷⁶ His treatise, circulating far and wide, had the approval of the patriarch Michael in Constantinople. Michael also closed all the churches in Constantinople which practiced any of the alleged errors of the Latins.

Leo IX wrote a long letter of 41 chapters to the Patriarch Michael in which he argued that he only is a successor of the apostle Peter, that he was invested with supreme authority over the universal Church, and that his word was law for the faithful to obey, not presenting any other defense for his practices.⁷⁷

The Papal legate Cardinal Humbert was sent to Constantinople to try to submit the Eastern Churches under the authority of Rome. Greek Patriarch and his counselors, offended by the arrogance of the legate, refused to give up their observance of Sabbath. Responding to this rejection of submission, during the Sabbath morning worship service, Cardinal Humbert, condemned the Church of East, nailing the excommunication letter on the altar of Saint Sophia Basilica. These are his words in the letter he wrote later:

⁷⁵ See Robert L. Odom, "The Sabbath in the Great Schism of AD 1054", in *Andrews University Seminary Studies*, vol. 1, 1963, p. 74.

⁷⁶ Nicetas Stethatos, *Libellus Contra Latinos* in Migne, *Patrologia Graeca*, vol. 120, pp. 1011-1022.

⁷⁷ Leo IX, *Epistle 100, to Michael Cerularius and Leo of Achrida*, in Migne, *Patrologia Latina*, vol. 143, pp. 775-777.

“...You Greeks, if you do not judaize, tell us why you have something in common with the Jews in a similar observance of the Sabbath? ...Wherefore, because you observe the Sabbath with the Jews and with us the Lord's Day, you appear by such observance to imitate the sect of Nazarens, who in this manner accept Christianity that they might not give up Judaism.”⁷⁸

In a letter to the patriarch of Antioch, Michael Cerularius reported the recent happenings at Constantinople and explained why he had refused to yield to the demands of the papal legates. Concerning the matter of Sabbath observance, he said: “For we are commanded also to honor the Sabbath equally with the Lord's Day and to keep it and not to work on it.”⁷⁹

This attitude of Greek Orthodox versus Sabbath remained throughout the high middle ages. Latin monk, Peter Damian in 1160 writes: “The observance of Saturday is, as everyone knows, the subject of a bitter dispute between the Greeks and the Latins.”⁸⁰ The Greek canonists Zonaras, Balsamon and Aristenus, representing the tradition of 12th century, all speak of the *Apostolic Canon* as still observed and binding.⁸¹ In the 13th century, we have a consultation of Nicolaus of Constantinople, as to the question of standing in prayer on the Sabbath, as well as the Lord's day: and his answer is that “to bend the knee on the Sabbath is not forbidden by the canon: but that men generally,

⁷⁸ Cardinal Humbert, *Adversus Calumnius Graecorum*, in Migne's, *Patrologia Latina*, vol. 143, pp. 936, 937.

⁷⁹ Patriarch Michael Cerularius, “Letter 1, to the Patriarch of Antioch” in Migne *Patrologia Graeca*, vol. 120, pp. 777, 778.

⁸⁰ Peter Damian, *Opuscula*, 5 in Migne's *Patrologia Latina*, vol. 145, p. 90

⁸¹ William E. Scudamore, “Sabbath” in *Dictionary of Christian Antiquities* (ed. W. Smith and S. Cheetham), London: John Murray, 1880, p. 1826.

because they do not follow the practice of fasting on Sabbath, refrain also from bonding the knee.”⁸²

Referring to the separation of the Greek Church from the Latin in 1054, Church Historian Philipp Schaff wrote in the late 19th century: “The observance of Sabbath among Jewish Christians gradually ceased; yet the Eastern Church to this day marks the seventh day of the week by omitting fasting, and standing in prayer.”⁸³

Sabbathkeeping in Russian Orthodox Church

There are some very early documents confirming the Sabbath-keeping in Russian Orthodox Church. For instance, during the period of 991-993, the Metropolitan of Kiev, Leonty wrote a polemical document against some of the practices of the Roman Church which were not practiced in the East. He writes:

“The 64th rule of the St. Apostles says: ‘if any of the clergy are seen fasting on the Lord’s Day or Sabbath this man will be disfellowshipped. If a layman, he will be expelled’ ... The 24th chapter of the 7th book of the *Apostolic Constitutions* says: “Celebrate Sabbath and Sunday”. On the first one remember the creation of the world and of the other one we remember God’s resurrection.”⁸⁴

This is a very strong Statement and it reflects the real situation of Sabbathkeeping in ancient Russia. Nevertheless, by the 15 century, this practice was compromised and work on Saturday became authorized. The Russian Orthodox Church still formally

⁸² *Idem.*

⁸³ Philipp Schaff, *History of the Church*, vol. 4, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1952, (first ed. 1864), p. 205.

⁸⁴ Boris Kalinnilov, *Metropolitans and Bisops under St. Vladiir*, Kiev: Chastnaja Tipographia, 1888, pp. 90, 91 see also Henry R. Huttenbach, “The Judaizer heresy and the origins of Muscovite anti-Semitism” in *Studies in Medieval Culture*, vol. 4, 1970, p. 496-506.

celebrated two days of the week but the emphasis came upon the celebrating of the Sunday. It is this period of Sabbath-negligence that saw the rise of Sabbath-keeping movements inside of Russian Church. One of these movements was called “Novgorod-Moscow Movement”.⁸⁵

The Novgorod-Moscow movement was a strict Sabbathkeeping movement that worshipped exclusively on Saturday and not on Sunday. The ancient Russian name for this people was *Strigolniks*. The origin of these Russian Sabbath-keepers was not from the Reformation of the sixteenth century; for they were in existence for at least one century prior to that event.

In 1479 grand Duke Ivan III accepted Strigolnik’s teaching and appointed their leaders as deans and bishops of Church of Russia in Moscow. In Moscow among many converts to the “Judaizers” were Archimandrite Zosima of Smonovsky Monastery, the future Russian primate and Theodore Kuritsyn, the Chancellor of the grand Duke. Even princes Hellena, daughter-in-law of grand Duke Ivan III was converted on Strigolnik’s faith.⁸⁶

Strigolnik’s view of Creation differed from the Orthodox view. For Eastern Orthodox Christianity, creation was an uncompleted act. Creation lost its perfection and it is intended to move towards it. In this light, the Sabbath was considered as a sign of

⁸⁵ “...There was a period of in Russian History when what we now call Protestant ideas were not merely popular, but accepted by the Russian royal family, many of the nobilities, intellectuals, as well as by many lower and middle class people... The period from the late 1470s through the first five years of the 16th century is referred by the contemporaries as a “heretic storm” of Novograd-Moscow movement.” (Oleg Zhigankow, *The meaning of Sabbath in the fifteenth-century Russian "Judaizers" movement*, Term Paper Andrews University, SDA Theological Seminary, 1997, p. 2)

⁸⁶ Sergej Bolshakoff, *Russian Nonconformity*, Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1950, pp. 31-34.

imperfect material creation while Sunday represents the move towards perfection and spiritual life.⁸⁷

For Moscow-Novgorod believers, Sabbath-keeping was not only the remembrance of God's creation, but the honoring of God's original, perfect creation. For Ivan Chernij, one of the leaders of this movement, the rejection of Sabbath was as blasphemous as the worship of icons and relics-which he understood as idols. To obey God's commandments, especially the first four which were too often neglected, is to glorify God in the right way. While the Orthodox believed that it is through spiritual exercises that they will obtain perfection and divinization, Russian Sabbathkeepers believed that it is through the obedience to God commandments that this is only possible.⁸⁸

Although very popular in the late 15th century, by the early 1500s, situation changed with the election of new prince Vasily (1505-1533) and Novgorod-Moscow group became persecuted as heretics. Similarly to Bogomils, Strigolniks were persecuted because of their condemnation of icons and opposition to corrupt government. Dr. Murdock reports: "This sect was so numerous that a national council was called, towards

⁸⁷ John Meyendorf, *Christ in Eastern Orthodox Church*, Crestwood: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1987, pp. 197-200; The teaching about perfection or deification (theosis) was created in early 14th century by Greek monk Gregory Palama and later integrated into the theology of the Russian Orthodox Church.

⁸⁸ Josef Volotskij, "Prosvetitel", Moscow: Spaso-Preobrazhensky monastery, 1993, p. 101, in Oleg Zhigankow, *Op. cit.* p. 14; Moscow-Novgorod members also disbelieved in immortality of the soul, calling death as Sabbath rest, after which will come the resurrection. (Manuscript 1036 from the collection of Moscow Theological Seminary in Oleg Zhigankow, p. 17.

the close of the fifteenth century, to oppose it.”⁸⁹ One of the prosecutors of Sabbatharians reports:

“The accused Judaizers were summoned; they openly acknowledged the new faith, and defended the same. The most eminent of them, the secretary of state, Kuritzyn, Ivan Maximow, Kassian, archimandrite of the Monastery of Novgorod, were condemned to death, and burned publicly in cages, at Moscow.”⁹⁰

Although the Strigolniks faced persecution, the re-emphasis on Sabbath observance influenced Russian Christianity. *Stoglav*, the official manuscript of the Russian Orthodox Church, dated in the year 1556, and containing materials from the Moscow Council during the reign of Ivan IV (1531-1584), has a chapter on the Sabbath:

“By the Authority of Peter and Paul, we command to the people to work during the week. But on *Subota* (Sabbath) and on *Nedelja* (Sunday) let them worship in the Church and pray, and let them learn something for the sake of good faith. The *Subota* is the image of the whole creation, while the *Nedelja* is the day of the resurrection.”⁹¹

The issue over Sabbath was very much alive in the 17th century when English traveler Samuel Purchas, writing from Moscow describes Russian Christians rejecting to fast on Sabbath. He writes “they ever since continued of the Greeke Communion and Religion; ...reputing it unlawful to fast on Saturdaies.” This same author, describing the doctrine of Sabbath-keeping Greek Orthodox communities, says:

⁸⁹ John N. Andrews, *History of the Sabbath*, (1887), Reprint Teach Services, Brushton (NY), 1998, p. 470; Scholars are divided on origins of Strigolnik believes, many believe that Strigolniks were influenced by Husite Waldensians from Poland., French writer Voltaire also connected them with Bohemian and Polish Waldenses. (Davis, pp. 101, 102)

⁹⁰ Date of the trial was Dec. 17, 1503, H. Sternberfi, “Geschichte der Juden”, Leipsig, 1873, pp. 117-122 in Zhigankow, p. 24.

⁹¹ *Stoglav*, izdanie D. E. Kozhanchikova, Sankpeterburg: Imperatoskaja Akademia Nauk, 1863, p. 270, quoted from Zhigankow, p. 25.

They admit Priests' Marriages.... That they reject the religious use of Massie, Images, or Statues, admitting yet Pictures or plaine Images in their Churches. That they solemnize Saturday (the old Sabbath) festively, and eat therein flesh, forbidding as unlawful, to fast any Saturday in the year except Easter Eve.⁹²

This reveals that the practice of Sabbath-keeping was alive within Russian Christianity in the 16th and 17th century although the celebration and observance of Sabbath declined after the persecution of Sabbath-keepers.

Subbotniki

During the reign of Catherine II, also known as Catherine the Great, (1729-1796) re-appeared in Russia Sabbath-keeping groups called Subbotniki (Russian: **Субботники**, lit. "Sabbatarians").⁹³ Dr. Samuel Kohn, chief Rabbi of Budapest, (Hungary) provided this information about Christians who kept the Sabbath in Russia and other Eastern European countries: "...Already around the year 1490 *Sabbatarians* emerged in Bohemia. Sabbatarians (Subotniki), or Judaizers also arose soon thereafter in Silesia, Poland and Russia; in the latter, where frequently confused with the Jews in the second half of this century, *they remain until today*."⁹⁴

According to the notes of various travelers to the east and official reports of the Imperial Russian government, most of the Subotniki's believed in absolute monotheism rather than the Christian Trinity, accepted only the Jewish Bible, and observed the

⁹² Samuel Purchase, *Purchase his Pilgrimes*, vol. 1, New York: Macmillan, 1907, p. 99.

⁹³ Tamar Davis, *A General History of the Sabbatharian Churches*, Philadelphia: Lindsay and Blakiston, 1851, pp. 101, 102.

⁹⁴ Samuel Kohn, *The Sabbatarians in Transylvania*, translated by Thomas McElwain and Bonne Book, Wooden (Australia): Christian Churches of God Publication, 1998, pp. 10-11, italics added.

Sabbath on Saturday instead of on Sunday. According to the same source, however, some of them, as, for instance, the Subbotniks of Moscow, did not circumcise and believed in Jesus, regarding him as a saint and prophet rather than as the son of God. Other groups reportedly awaited the coming of the Messiah as king of the earth, in line with Judaism's view. Some reportedly revered the New Testament, while others placed it on a lower level than the Old Testament.⁹⁵

It is impossible to determine the exact number of Subbotniks in Russia at any given time. The discrepancies between government statistics and the actual membership varied widely. Official data from czarist times placed the membership of the sect at several thousand, while the traveler and writer E. Dinard, who was in personal contact with the Subbotniks, stated that there were 2,500,000. It may be that Dinard included in his figures *all* of the Judaizing Christian and Jewish groups, and not just the Subbotniks. Regarding dress and lifestyle, apart from their religious rites, the Subbotniks were indistinguishable from Russian Orthodox or secular Russians.⁹⁶

Summary

In the early Middle Ages, the Sabbathkeeping remained as one of the distinguishing characteristics of Eastern Orthodoxy. The examples of Iconoclastic reforms, Bulgarian controversy and Great Schism show that the Sabbath was very lively appreciated and kept among Greeks all the way until the fall of Constantinople in 1453.

⁹⁵ Samuel Hurwitz, "Subbotniki." in *Jewish Encyclopedia*, vol. 11, New York: MacMillan, 1906, pp. 577, 578.

⁹⁶ Ernest Dinard, "Subbotniki" in *Ha-Meliz*, (Russian Hebrew Paper) 1887, No. 75.

After the initial Christianization of Slavic nations, the Eastern Church found firm ground in Russia and soon Moscow became the center of Orthodox world. In early stages of Russian Orthodoxy, Sabbath as well as Sunday was particularly observed, especially in the early years of Russian Kingdom. In the same time more extreme Sabbathkeeping movements were persecuted like Strigolniks and their counterparts in the Balkans, the Bogomils.

Gradually, the Sabbath lost the early significance in both Greek and Russian Church. The theology of the extreme sanctification (*theosis*) prevalent in Medieval Orthodox Church came to consider Sabbath as a sign of imperfect creation praising Sunday as a symbol of resurrection and new celestial life. This theology was one of the main factors for the neglect of Sabbath in Post-Reformation Orthodoxy.

CONCLUSION

Summary

As demonstrated in this paper, doctrinally and traditionally the Eastern Orthodox Church can historically be placed in the category of the Sabbath-observing Church. Although many lay Orthodox today may not know this, the Sabbath occupied very important place in history of Eastern liturgical tradition. Since the earliest years of Christianity, the Eastern Christians championed the Apostolic Sabbath-keeping being the main defenders of Sabbath that was so categorically rejected by the Western Church.

Saturday had been observed by those in Asia Minor and Constantinople (primary see) for centuries. Greek patriarchy in Constantinople influenced early Bulgarian and

Russian Orthodox Church in their respect towards Saturday. Majority of Churches of the East from Armenia to China also preserved Sabbath worship and Sabbath rest until this day due to the emphasis on Sabbath drawing from Greek Christianity.

Respect for Seventh-day Sabbath represented one of the greatest factors in the separation between Orthodox and Catholic Christianity. The Eastern Orthodox Christians today still refer to “Apostolic Constitutions” as their earliest creed or confession of faith. The words in the book 7, chapters 36 of the said document are still often quoted: “O Lord Almighty, Thou hast created the world by Christ, and hast appointed the Sabbath in memory thereof, because that day thou hast made us rest from our works, for the meditation upon thy law.”⁹⁷

One Modern Orthodox theologians recently stated: “In the tradition of our Church, Saturday like Sunday is considered a festal day. Even during the Great Lent the rules of fasting are relaxed on Saturdays and Sundays.”⁹⁸ The Orthodox Church has never reformulated a creed to replace Sabbath with Sunday, as it was the case with its Western counterpart where Pope exercised authority to change certain laws and precepts of the Hebrew Scriptures and the Apostles. Official Orthodox Church recognizes that Saturday is the Sabbath day, not Sunday, and many Orthodox countries have traditionally recognized the Seventh day as a day of rest even if some of its members do not. This is

⁹⁷ *Ante-Nicene Fathers*, Vol. 7, p. 474; “The Trullan Council in 692 accepted that portion of Apostolic Constitutions to which has been given the name “Apostolic Canons” was received as authentic. The Apostolic Constitutions were held generally in high esteem and served as the basis for much ecclesiastical legislation. They are today of the highest value as an historical document, revealing the moral and religious conditions and the liturgical observances of the third and fourth centuries.” (See John B. Peterson, “Apostolic Constitutions” in *Catholic Encyclopedia*, vol. 1, New York: MacMillan, 1907)

⁹⁸ Alkiviadis Calivas, *The Great and Holy Saturday*, Greek Orthodox Archdiocese of America, 2003.

reflected in many languages which use a variation of “Sabbath” for Saturday, the Russian is “Soebôta”, Serbian and Bulgarian “Subota”.⁹⁹

Personal Findings

One may wonder how did the Orthodox Church, despite such a historical importance and tradition, possibly forget Saturday. It is obvious that the neglect of Sabbath never came through an official decree but it introduced itself quite gradually with the laxity of the masses and the preference for less formal Sunday in which there was no explicit law which would prohibit secular activities.

However, there is also a theological explanation that was mentioned in the pages of this study and it deserves to be recapitulated in these resuming pages.

In Eastern Orthodox liturgy Sabbath has always been and remained until today the seventh day of the week while Sunday is the first day of the week. However, Orthodoxy also often saw Sunday as a mystical *eighth* Day, the day that brings perfection, called the Lord’s Day. The preference of Sunday is closely connected with the Orthodox doctrine of *obozenje* (theosis). This doctrine in its present form was first introduced in early 14th century by Greek monk Gregory Palama and later integrated into the theology of the Orthodox Church.

Palama developed a neo-Gnostic thought that the creation was an uncompleted act which was intended to move towards the state of divine perfection.¹⁰⁰ Practical

⁹⁹ See the influence of the word Sabbath in over 160 world languages, William Meade Jones, *Chart of the Week*, 1887, Available Online: <<http://www.sabbathtruth.com/documentation/languages.asp>>

¹⁰⁰ See John Meyendorff, *Christ in Eastern Orthodox Church*, Crestwood: St. Vladimir’s Seminary Press, 1987, pp. 197-200.

ramification of this doctrine is the neglect of Sabbath as a commemoration of (imperfect) creation and elevation of Sunday, the day of resurrection and the day that commemorates the re-birth of new perfect life in Jesus Christ. This doctrine, combined with the long-present Orthodox monastic passion of mystical sanctification, created a liturgical atmosphere in which Sabbatarianism was not welcome any more.

On the other side, through the history of Eastern Orthodoxy, there was often a strong presence of Sabbath-revival movements, which would sometimes influence the Church of the State to reconsider the return to the observance of the Sabbath. Such movements were present from earliest centuries under the various names such as Nazarens, Paulicians, Bogomils, Strigolniks, Subotniki etc.

Is it possible that today in the time when Sabbath and precepts from Apostolic Constitution are forgotten again, we may witness another revival of early Apostolic Sabbath-keeping? One Orthodox theologian answering on this questions stated: “I think some people may believe that Sunday has replaced Saturday, but there really is no traditional support for that position. What I guess is really up for debate is the relative importance of the Sabbath and keeping it as a day of rest in relation to Sunday, and here I **am certainly open to relevant pious opinion and local practice which may vary.**”¹⁰¹

The Orthodox Church today is still stretched between two choices. Will it bow to the rising ecumenical attempts to join the universal Sunday keeping or will it rather side with the Bible, Apostolic Canon and their long tradition of honoring the Seventh-day Sabbath?

¹⁰¹ *Experts Answering Question on Orthodoxy*, <<http://en.allexperts.com/q/Eastern-Orthodox-1456/Sabbath.htm>>, 12/31/07

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Primary Sources

Asterius of Amasea, “sermon 5: On Divorce” in *Sermons*, transcribed by Roger Pearse, Ipswich, 2003,
 <http://www.earlychristianwritings.com/fathers/asterius_05_sermon5.htm>, 12/03/07

Athanasius, *Homilia de Semente*, section 1 in *Patrologia Graeca*, vol. 28, (J.-P. Mignes ed.) vol. 12, Paris: Garnier Frères, 1956.

Bible, New King James

Bible, New International Version

Cassian, *Institutes*, 3: 2 in *New Advent Catholic Encyclopedia*, Available Online:
 <<http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/3507.htm>>, 12/03/07

Patriarch Michael Cerularius, “Letter 1, to the Patriarch of Antioch” in *Patrologia Latina* vol. 120, (J.-P. Migne ed.), Paris: Garnier Frères, 1956, pp. 777, 778.

Codex Justinianus, in Philip Schaff, *History of the Christian Church*, vol. 3, New York: Scribner, 1902.

(*The*) *Complete Canons of the Synod of Laodicea*, Canon 29 in *New Advent Catholic Encyclopedia*, Online edition (ed. Kevin Knight), 2007,
 <www.newadvent.org/fathers/3806.htm>, 12/03/07

Constitutions of the Holy Apostles, Book 7, Section 2; Book 8, Section 4 and 23 in *Ante-Nicene Fathers*, vol. 7, (ed. Philip Schaff), Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, p. 712.

Didache, translated by Joseph B. Lightfoot in *Apostolic Fathers*, Lightfoot & Harmer, 1891, (2001 ed. Peter Kirby), pp. 121- 133, Available Online
 <<http://www.earlychristianwritings.com/didache.html>>, 12/03/07

Dinard, Ernest, “Subbotniki” in *Ha-Meliz*, No. 75, (Russian Hebrew Paper) 1887.

Epiphanius, *The Panarion of Epiphanius of Salamis, Book I (Sects 1-46)*, Frank Williams, translator, Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1987, pp. 119-152, Excerpts available Online at: <<http://www.earlychristianwritings.com/text/gospelebionites-panarion.html>>, 12/03/07

Epistle of Barnabas in *Ante-Nicene Fathers*, vol. 1, (ed. Philip Schaff), Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2001, pp. 182-203.

Eusebius, *Church History and Life of Constantine*, in *Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers*, (P. Schaff ed.), reprint Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2001, vol. 1, pp. 227-230.

Eusebius, *Commentary on the Psalms* in *Patrologia Graeca*, vol. 23, (J.-P. Mignes ed.) vol. 12, Paris: Garnier Frères, 1956.

Eusebius, *Ecclesiastical History*, vol. 3, in *New Advent Catholic Encyclopedia*, Online edition, (K. Knight ed.), 2007, <<http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/25023.htm>>, 12/03/07

Gregory I, *Registrum Epistolarum*, Book 13, Letter 1 in *New Advent Catholic Encyclopedia*, Available Online: <<http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/3602.htm>>, 12/03/07

Gregory of Nyssa, *De Castigatione (On Reproof)* in *Patrologia Graeca*, vol. 46, (J.-P. Migne ed.) vol. 12, Paris: Garnier Frères, 1956.

Humbert, Cardinal *Adversus Calumnius Graecorum*, in *Patrologia Latina*, vol. 143, (J.-P. Migne ed.), Paris: Garnier Frères, 1956.

Ignatius of Antioch, *Letter to the Magnesians*, in *Ante-Nicene Fathers*, vol. 1, (ed. Philip Schaff), Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2001, pp. 86-95.

Ignatius of Antioch, *Letter to the Trallians* in, *Ante-Nicene Fathers*, vol. 1, (ed. Philip Schaff), Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2001, pp. 95-105.

Irenaeus of Lyon, *Against Heresies*, book 1, in *Ante-Nicene Fathers*, vol. 1, (ed. Philip Schaff), Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2001, p. 448-513.

Jerome, *to Augustine*, Letter 75, par. 13 in *Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers*, Series 1, Volume 1. (ed. Philip Schaff), New York: Christian Literature Publishing Co., 1886, p. 482

Justin Martyr, *Dialogue With Trypho* in *Ante-Nicene Fathers*, vol. 1, (ed. Philip Schaff), Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2001, pp. 263-384.

Justin Martyr, *First Apology* in *Ante-Nicene Fathers*, vol. 1, (ed. Philip Schaff), Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2001, pp. 210-252.

Leo IX, *Epistle 100, to Michael Cerularius and Leo of Achrida*, in *Patrologia Latina*, vol. 143, (J.-P. Migne ed.) Paris: Garnier Frères, 1956.

The Martyrdom of Polycarp, Ante-Nicene Fathers, vol. 1, (ed. Philip Schaff), Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2001, pp. 58-66.

Nicolas I, “Consulta Bulgarorum”, Responsum 10, found in Giovanni D. Mansi, *Sacrorum Conciliorum Nova et Amplissima Colectio*, Vol.15 Paris: H. Welter, 1920

Pliny, *Letters*, (edit. and transl. William Melmoth), New York: MacMillan, 1915.

Origen, *Homily on Numbers 23*, in *Patrologia Graeca*, (J.-P. Migne ed.) vol. 12, Paris: Garnier Frères, 1956.

(*The Oxyrhynchus Papyri*, pt. L, p. 3, Logion 2, verses 4-11 (London: Offices of the Egypt Exploration Fund, 1898).

Ross, Alexander, *Pansebia: A view of all Religions of the World*, London: John Saywell & Co, 1655.

Sidonius Apollinaris, *Espitolae*, book. 1, letter 2, in *Patrologia Latina*, vol. 58, (J.-P. Mignes ed.) vol. 12, Paris: Garnier Frères, 1955.

Socrates, *Ecclesiastical History*, in *Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers; Socrates and Sozomens Ecclesiastical Histories*, volume 2, (eds. Phillip Schaff and Henry Wace), Grand Rapids: Eerdmans Publishing, 2000, pp. 2-325.

Sozomen, *Memoirs*, in *Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers; Socrates and Sozomens Ecclesiastical Histories*, volume 2, (eds. Phillip Schaff and Henry Wace), Grand Rapids: Eerdmans Publishing, 2000, pp. 326-698.

Stethatos, Nicetas, *Libellus Contra Latinos* in *Patrologia Graeca*, vol. 120, (ed. J.-P. Migne), Paris: Garnier Frères, 1956, pp. 1011-1022.

Sylvester I, *Concerning the Instruction of the Clergymen*, Book II, Chap. 46, in *Patrologia Latina*, vol. 107, (J.-P. Mignes ed.) Paris: Garnier Frères, 1955.

Theophilus of Antioch, *To Autolytus*, Book 2, in *Ante-Nicene Fathers*, vol. 2, (ed. Philip Schaff), Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2001, pp. 143-177.

Tertullian, in *Ante-Nicene Fathers*, vol. 3, (ed. Philip Schaff), Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2001.

Secondary Sources

Books:

Andrews, John N., *History of the Sabbath*, (1887), Reprint Teach Services, Brushton (NY), 1998.

- Atiya, Aziz S., *A History of Eastern Christianity*, London: Methuen and Co., 1968.
- Bacchiocchi, Samuel, *Anti-Judaism and the Origin of Sunday*, An excerpt of the Doctoral Dissertation, Rome: Pontifical Gregorian University Press, 1975.
- Bradford, Charles E., *Sabbath Roots, The African Connection*, L. Brown and Sons, Barre (VT), 1999.
- Brown, Harold O. J., *Heresies: Heresy and Orthodoxy in the History of the Church*, Peabody: Hendrickson Publishers, 1988.
- Bolshakoff, Sergej *Russian Nonconformity*, Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1950.
- Calivas, Alkiviadis, *The Great and Holy Saturday*, Greek Orthodox Archdiocese of America, 2003.
- Chidester, David, *Christianity: A Global History*, San Francisco: HarperCollins, 2000.
- Craig, Harline, *Sunday: A History of the First Day from Babylonia to Super Bowl* Doubleday, NY, 2007.
- Davis, Tamar, *A General History of the Sabbatarian Churches*, Philadelphia: Lindsay and Blakiston, 1851.
- Dugger, Andrew N. and Clarence O. Dodd, *A History of the True Religion*, (3rd ed.) Jerusalem: Church of God 7th day Press, 1972.
- Encyclopedia Britannica*, Concise Online Edition, <<http://concise.britannica.com/ebc/article-9363331/Eastern-Orthodoxy>>, 12/03/07.
- Grayzel, Solomon, *The History of the Jews*, Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 1947.
- Hefele, Karl Joseph Von, *Conciliengeschichte*, vol. 4, Freiburg im Breisgau: Herder, 1877.
- Hergenroether, Joseph, *Photius*, vol. 3, Regensburg: G. J. Manz, 1869.
- Jones, William Meade *Chart of the Week*, 1887, Available Online: <[http://www.sabbathtruth.com/documentation /languages.asp](http://www.sabbathtruth.com/documentation/languages.asp)> 12/03/07
- Kalinnilov, Boris, *Metropolitans and Bisops under St. Vladiir*, Kiev: Chastnaja Tipographia, 1888.
- Kidd, Benjamin J., *The Churches of Eastern Christendom*, London: Faith Press, 1927.

Kohn, Samuel, *The Sabbatarians in Transylvania*, translated by Thomas McElwain and Bonne Book, Wooden (Australia): Christian Churches of God Publication, 1998.

Meyendorf, John, *Christ in Eastern Orthodox Church*, Crestwood: St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1987.

Metzger, Bruce M., *Studies in Lectionary Text of the Greek New Testament*, vol. 2 Chicago: University Press, 1944.

Mingana, Alphonse, *Early Spread of Christianity in central Asia and Far East*, vol. 10, Oxford: University Press, 1925.

Neander, August, *General History of the Christian Religion and Church*, vol. 2, London: Henry G. Bohn, 1852.

Neumann, Blaine, *A History of the Seventh day Sabbath among Christians in Asia, Africa, Europe and North America*, Gillette: Bible Sabbath Association, 2004.

Obolensky, Dimitri, *The Bogomils*, Cambridge: University Press, 1948.

Ormanian, Malachia, *The Church of Armenia*, New York: St. Vartan Press, 1988.

Pritz, Robert A., *Nazarene Jewish Christianity*, Jerusalem: Hebrew University Magnus Press, 1988, pp. 24, 34, 45.

Purchase, Samuel, *Purchase his Pilgrims*, vol. 1, New York: Macmillan, 1907, p. 99.

Roberson, Ronald, *The Eastern Christian Churches*, Roma: Edizione Orientalia Christiana, Istituto Pontificio Orientale, sixth edition, 1996 (1st ed. 1986).

Schaff, Philipp, *History of the Church*, vol. 4, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1952, (first ed. 1864).

Schmemmann, Alexander, *The Historical Road of Eastern Orthodoxy*, New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1963.

Strand, Kenneth, *Sabbath and Sunday in Scripture and History*, Washington: Review and Herald, 1982.

Wilkinson, Benjamin G., *Truth Triumphant: The Church in the Wilderness*, Rapidan (VA): Hartland Publications, 1995.

Zhigankow, Oleg, *The meaning of Sabbath in the fifteenth-century Russian "Judaizers" movement*, Term Paper Andrews University, SDA Theological Seminary, 1997.

Articles:

Bacchiocchi, Samuel, "The Rise of Sunday Observance in Early Christianity" in *The Sabbath in Scripture and History*, (K. A. Strand, ed.), Washington: Review and Herald, 1982, pp. 130-159..

Gaster, Moses, "Bogomils" in *Encyclopedia Britannica*, 11th ed. (1910), pp. 119, 120.

Grunebaum, Gustave E. Vo, "Byzantine Iconoclasm and the Influence of the Islamic Environment" in *History of Religions*, vol. 2, no. 1 (Summer, 1962), pp. 1-10.

Samuel Hurwitz, "Subbotniki." in *Jewish Encyclopedia*, vol. 11, New York: MacMillan, 1906, pp. 577, 578.

Huttenbach, Henry R., "The Judaizer heresy and the origins of Muscovite anti-Semitism" in *Studies in Medieval Culture*, 1970, vol. 4, p. 496-506.

Krauss, Richard, "Hadrian" in *Jewish Encyclopedia*, vol. 3, New York: Funk and Wagnalis, 1907.

Kunze, Johannes, "Nestorians" in *New Schaff Herzog Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Baker House (reprint), 1953.

Nichol, Francis D, "Hebrews 4:9" in *The Seventh-day Adventist Bible Commentary*, Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1978.

Odom, Robert L., "The Sabbath in the Great Schism of AD 1054", in *Andrews University Seminary Studies*, vol. 1, 1963, pp. 70-96.

Patterson, Stephen M., "The Scholars Version translation of the Gospel of Thomas", Verse 27 in *The Complete Gospels: Annotated Scholars Version*, Polebridge Press; 1994, Available Online at: <<http://www.earlychristianwritings.com/thomas.html>>.

Peterson, John B., "Apostolic Constitutions" in *Catholic Encyclopedia*, vol. 1, New York: The Encyclopedia Press, 1907.

Scudamore, William E., "Sabbath" in *Dictionary of Christian Antiquities* (ed. W. Smith and S. Cheetham), London: John Murray, 1880, p. 1826.

Tomson, Peter "The Wars against Rome; the Rise of Rabbinic Judaism and of Apostolic Gentile Christianity, and the Judeo-Christians" in *The Image of Judeo-Christians in Ancient Jewish and Christian Literature*, (P. Tomson and D. Lambers-Petry eds.), Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2003.

Thurston, Herbert, "Calendar" in *Catholic Encyclopedia*, vol. 3, New York: The Encyclopedia Press, 1908, pp. 158-166.

Gerhard Uhlhorn, "Ebionites", in *A Religious Encyclopaedia of Biblical, Historical, Doctrinal, and Practical Theology*, (vol. 2), (Philip Schaff ed.), 3rd ed. 1894

Timothy Ware, *The Orthodox Church*, London: Penguin Books, 1997.

Herold Weiss, *A Day of Gladness; The Sabbath among Jews and Christians in Antiquity*, Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 2003.

Paul Wong, "The History of the Sabbath and Sunday" in *The Sabbath Sentinel*, Gillette: Bible Sabbath Association, vol. 52, no. 5, pp. 3-28.

Self-evaluation

INTRODUCTION:	55
1. Statement of Problem.....	15
2. Purpose of Study.....	15
3. Methodology	15
4. Limitations and Presuppositions.....	10
RESEARCH QUALITIES	
1. Adequate Sources.....	50
2. Accuracy, quality and neatness of research.....	150
3. Significant findings and contributions.....	25
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	25
LOGICAL FLOW AND READABILITY.....	25
ORGANIZATION OF THE RESEARCH.....	20
STYLE AND FORMAT.....	22
GRAMMAR, SPELLING.....	15
SUMMARIES.....	25
CONCLUSIONS.....	50
1. Findings.....	35
2. Unique Contribution.....	15
PROPOSAL.....	20
ON TIME.....	15
GRADE	10
TOTAL.....	482